

1 Marisa C. Ordonia (WSB #48081)
2 EARTHJUSTICE
3 810 3rd Avenue, Suite 610
4 Seattle, WA 98104-1711
5 T: 206.343.7340
6 F: 206.343.1526
7 E: mordonia@earthjustice.org

8 Hannah M. Payne (AK Bar #2105045) (*pro hac vice* pending)
9 Jeremy C. Lieb (AK Bar #1810088) (*pro hac vice* pending)
10 EARTHJUSTICE
11 441 W 5th Avenue, Suite 301
12 Anchorage, AK 99501
13 T: 907.277.2500
14 F: 907.277.1390
15 E: hpayne@earthjustice.org
16 jlieb@earthjustice.org

17 *Attorneys for Citizens for Clean Air, a project of*
18 *Alaska Community Action on Toxics, and Sierra Club*

19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65
66
67
68
69
70
71
72
73
74
75
76
77
78
79
80
81
82
83
84
85
86
87
88
89
90
91
92
93
94
95
96
97
98
99
100
101
102
103
104
105
106
107
108
109
110
111
112
113
114
115
116
117
118
119
120
121
122
123
124
125
126
127
128
129
130
131
132
133
134
135
136
137
138
139
140
141
142
143
144
145
146
147
148
149
150
151
152
153
154
155
156
157
158
159
160
161
162
163
164
165
166
167
168
169
170
171
172
173
174
175
176
177
178
179
180
181
182
183
184
185
186
187
188
189
190
191
192
193
194
195
196
197
198
199
200
201
202
203
204
205
206
207
208
209
210
211
212
213
214
215
216
217
218
219
220
221
222
223
224
225
226
227
228
229
230
231
232
233
234
235
236
237
238
239
240
241
242
243
244
245
246
247
248
249
250
251
252
253
254
255
256
257
258
259
259
260
261
262
263
264
265
266
267
268
269
269
270
271
272
273
274
275
276
277
278
279
279
280
281
282
283
284
285
286
287
288
289
289
290
291
292
293
294
295
296
297
298
299
299
300
301
302
303
304
305
306
307
308
309
309
310
311
312
313
314
315
316
317
318
319
319
320
321
322
323
324
325
326
327
328
329
329
330
331
332
333
334
335
336
337
338
339
339
340
341
342
343
344
345
346
347
348
349
349
350
351
352
353
354
355
356
357
358
359
359
360
361
362
363
364
365
366
367
368
369
369
370
371
372
373
374
375
376
377
378
379
379
380
381
382
383
384
385
386
387
388
389
389
390
391
392
393
394
395
396
397
398
399
399
400
401
402
403
404
405
406
407
408
409
409
410
411
412
413
414
415
416
417
418
419
419
420
421
422
423
424
425
426
427
428
429
429
430
431
432
433
434
435
436
437
438
439
439
440
441
442
443
444
445
446
447
448
449
449
450
451
452
453
454
455
456
457
458
459
459
460
461
462
463
464
465
466
467
468
469
469
470
471
472
473
474
475
476
477
478
479
479
480
481
482
483
484
485
486
487
488
489
489
490
491
492
493
494
495
496
497
498
499
499
500
501
502
503
504
505
506
507
508
509
509
510
511
512
513
514
515
516
517
518
519
519
520
521
522
523
524
525
526
527
528
529
529
530
531
532
533
534
535
536
537
538
539
539
540
541
542
543
544
545
546
547
548
549
549
550
551
552
553
554
555
556
557
558
559
559
560
561
562
563
564
565
566
567
568
569
569
570
571
572
573
574
575
576
577
578
579
579
580
581
582
583
584
585
586
587
588
589
589
590
591
592
593
594
595
596
597
598
599
599
600
601
602
603
604
605
606
607
608
609
609
610
611
612
613
614
615
616
617
618
619
619
620
621
622
623
624
625
626
627
628
629
629
630
631
632
633
634
635
636
637
638
639
639
640
641
642
643
644
645
646
647
648
649
649
650
651
652
653
654
655
656
657
658
659
659
660
661
662
663
664
665
666
667
668
669
669
670
671
672
673
674
675
676
677
678
679
679
680
681
682
683
684
685
686
687
688
689
689
690
691
692
693
694
695
696
697
697
698
699
699
700
701
702
703
704
705
706
707
708
709
709
710
711
712
713
714
715
716
717
718
719
719
720
721
722
723
724
725
726
727
728
729
729
730
731
732
733
734
735
736
737
738
739
739
740
741
742
743
744
745
746
747
748
749
749
750
751
752
753
754
755
756
757
758
759
759
760
761
762
763
764
765
766
767
768
769
769
770
771
772
773
774
775
776
777
778
779
779
780
781
782
783
784
785
786
787
788
789
789
790
791
792
793
794
795
796
797
797
798
799
799
800
801
802
803
804
805
806
807
808
809
809
810
811
812
813
814
815
816
817
818
819
819
820
821
822
823
824
825
826
827
828
829
829
830
831
832
833
834
835
836
837
838
839
839
840
841
842
843
844
845
846
847
848
849
849
850
851
852
853
854
855
856
857
858
859
859
860
861
862
863
864
865
866
867
868
869
869
870
871
872
873
874
875
876
877
878
879
879
880
881
882
883
884
885
886
887
888
889
889
890
891
892
893
894
895
896
897
897
898
899
899
900
901
902
903
904
905
906
907
908
909
909
910
911
912
913
914
915
916
917
918
919
919
920
921
922
923
924
925
926
927
928
929
929
930
931
932
933
934
935
936
937
938
939
939
940
941
942
943
944
945
946
947
948
949
949
950
951
952
953
954
955
956
957
958
959
959
960
961
962
963
964
965
966
967
968
969
969
970
971
972
973
974
975
976
977
978
979
979
980
981
982
983
984
985
986
987
988
989
989
990
991
992
993
994
995
996
997
997
998
999
999
1000
1001
1002
1003
1004
1005
1006
1007
1008
1009
1009
1010
1011
1012
1013
1014
1015
1016
1017
1018
1019
1019
1020
1021
1022
1023
1024
1025
1026
1027
1028
1029
1029
1030
1031
1032
1033
1034
1035
1036
1037
1038
1039
1039
1040
1041
1042
1043
1044
1045
1046
1047
1048
1049
1049
1050
1051
1052
1053
1054
1055
1056
1057
1058
1059
1059
1060
1061
1062
1063
1064
1065
1066
1067
1068
1069
1069
1070
1071
1072
1073
1074
1075
1076
1077
1078
1079
1079
1080
1081
1082
1083
1084
1085
1086
1087
1088
1089
1089
1090
1091
1092
1093
1094
1095
1096
1097
1097
1098
1099
1099
1100
1101
1102
1103
1104
1105
1106
1107
1108
1109
1109
1110
1111
1112
1113
1114
1115
1116
1117
1118
1119
1119
1120
1121
1122
1123
1124
1125
1126
1127
1128
1129
1129
1130
1131
1132
1133
1134
1135
1136
1137
1138
1139
1139
1140
1141
1142
1143
1144
1145
1146
1147
1148
1149
1149
1150
1151
1152
1153
1154
1155
1156
1157
1158
1159
1159
1160
1161
1162
1163
1164
1165
1166
1167
1168
1169
1169
1170
1171
1172
1173
1174
1175
1176
1177
1178
1179
1179
1180
1181
1182
1183
1184
1185
1186
1187
1188
1189
1189
1190
1191
1192
1193
1194
1195
1196
1197
1197
1198
1199
1199
1200
1201
1202
1203
1204
1205
1206
1207
1208
1209
1209
1210
1211
1212
1213
1214
1215
1216
1217
1218
1219
1219
1220
1221
1222
1223
1224
1225
1226
1227
1228
1229
1229
1230
1231
1232
1233
1234
1235
1236
1237
1238
1239
1239
1240
1241
1242
1243
1244
1245
1246
1247
1248
1249
1249
1250
1251
1252
1253
1254
1255
1256
1257
1258
1259
1259
1260
1261
1262
1263
1264
1265
1266
1267
1268
1269
1269
1270
1271
1272
1273
1274
1275
1276
1277
1278
1279
1279
1280
1281
1282
1283
1284
1285
1286
1287
1288
1289
1289
1290
1291
1292
1293
1294
1295
1296
1297
1297
1298
1299
1299
1300
1301
1302
1303
1304
1305
1306
1307
1308
1309
1309
1310
1311
1312
1313
1314
1315
1316
1317
1318
1319
1319
1320
1321
1322
1323
1324
1325
1326
1327
1328
1329
1329
1330
1331
1332
1333
1334
1335
1336
1337
1338
1339
1339
1340
1341
1342
1343
1344
1345
1346
1347
1348
1349
1349
1350
1351
1352
1353
1354
1355
1356
1357
1358
1359
1359
1360
1361
1362
1363
1364
1365
1366
1367
1368
1369
1369
1370
1371
1372
1373
1374
1375
1376
1377
1378
1379
1379
1380
1381
1382
1383
1384
1385
1386
1387
1388
1389
1389
1390
1391
1392
1393
1394
1395
1396
1397
1397
1398
1399
1399
1400
1401
1402
1403
1404
1405
1406
1407
1408
1409
1409
1410
1411
1412
1413
1414
1415
1416
1417
1418
1419
1419
1420
1421
1422
1423
1424
1425
1426
1427
1428
1429
1429
1430
1431
1432
1433
1434
1435
1436
1437
1438
1439
1439
1440
1441
1442
1443
1444
1445
1446
1447
1448
1449
1449
1450
1451
1452
1453
1454
1455
1456
1457
1458
1459
1459
1460
1461
1462
1463
1464
1465
1466
1467
1468
1469
1469
1470
1471
1472
1473
1474
1475
1476
1477
1478
1479
1479
1480
1481
1482
1483
1484
1485
1486
1487
1488
1489
1489
1490
1491
1492
1493
1494
1495
1496
1497
1497
1498
1499
1499
1500
1501
1502
1503
1504
1505
1506
1507
1508
1509
1509
1510
1511
1512
1513
1514
1515
1516
1517
1518
1519
1519
1520
1521
1522
1523
1524
1525
1526
1527
1528
1529
1529
1530
1531
1532
1533
1534
1535
1536
1537
1538
1539
1539
1540
1541
1542
1543
1544
1545
1546
1547
1548
1549
1549
1550
1551
1552
1553
1554
1555
1556
1557
1558
1559
1559
1560
1561
1562
1563
1564
1565
1566
1567
1568
1569
1569
1570
1571
1572
1573
1574
1575
1576
1577
1578
1579
1579
1580
1581
1582
1583
1584
1585
1586
1587
1588
1589
1589
1590
1591
1592
1593
1594
1595
1596
1597
1597
1598
1599
1599
1600
1601
1602
1603
1604
1605
1606
1607
1608
1609
1609
1610
1611
1612
1613
1614
1615
1616
1617
1618
1619
1619
1620
1621
1622
1623
1624
1625
1626
1627
1628
1629
1629
1630
1631
1632
1633
1634
1635
1636
1637
1638
1639
1639
1640
1641
1642
1643
1644
1645
1646
1647
1648
1649
1649
1650
1651
1652
1653
1654
1655
1656
1657
1658
1659
1659
1660
1661
1662
1663
1664
1665
1666
1667
1668
1669
1669
1670
1671
1672
1673
1674
1675
1676
1677
1678
1679
1679
1680
1681
1682
1683
1684
1685
1686
1687
1688
1689
1689
1690
1691
1692
1693
1694
1695
1696
1697
1697
1698
1699
1699
1700
1701
1702
1703
1704
1705
1706
1707
1708
1709
1709
1710
1711
1712
1713
1714
1715
1716
1717
1718
1719
1719
1720
1721
1722
1723
1724
1725
1726
1727
1728
1729
1729
1730
1731
1732
1733
1734
1735
1736
1737
1738
1739
1739
1740
1741
1742
1743
1744
1745
1746
1747
1748
1749
1749
1750
1751
1752
1753
1754
1755
1756
1757
1758
1759
1759
1760
1761
1762
1763
1764
1765
1766
1767
1768
1769
1769
1770
1771
1772
1773
1774
1775
1776
1777
1778
1779
1779
1780
1781
1782
1783
1784
1785
1786
1787
1788
1789
1789
1790
1791
1792
1793
1794
1795
1796
1797
1797
1798
1799
1799
1800
1801
1802
1803
1804
1805
1806
1807
1808
1809
1809
1810
1811
1812
1813
1814
1815
1816
1817
1818
1819
1819
1820
1821
1822
1823
1824
1825
1826
1827
1828
1829
1829
1830
1831
1832
1833
1834
1835
1836
1837
1838
1839
1839
1840
1841
1842
1843
1844
1845
1846
1847
1848
1849
1849
1850
1851
18

INTRODUCTION

2 1. The Fairbanks North Star Borough (“Fairbanks” or “the Borough”) has some of
3 the worst fine particulate matter (PM_{2.5}) air pollution in the nation, with levels over twice the
4 federal limit for healthy air. Defendants have known about Fairbanks’s harmful PM_{2.5} pollution
5 for more than a decade, but they have repeatedly failed to take action to address the problem, as
6 mandated by the Clean Air Act. Most recently, they failed to approve or disapprove the state of
7 Alaska’s December 15, 2020, proposed revision to the Fairbanks PM_{2.5} state implementation
8 plan (SIP). Due in part to Defendants’ ongoing delay, the people of Fairbanks, particularly the
9 Borough’s most vulnerable and marginalized populations, continue to be endangered by the
10 harms of PM_{2.5} exposure.

11 2. The federal government recognizes the dangers that PM_{2.5} exposure poses to the
12 people of Fairbanks. Under the Clean Air Act, the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA)
13 regulates PM_{2.5} pollution, imposing relevant 24-hour National Ambient Air Quality Standards
14 (NAAQS). 62 Fed. Reg. 38,652 (July 18, 1997) (adopting 24-hour NAAQS for PM_{2.5}); 71 Fed.
15 Reg. 61,144 (Oct. 17, 2006) (codified at 40 C.F.R. § 50.13) (strengthening standards).

16 3. In November 2009, EPA designated the Borough as a nonattainment area in
17 violation of the 2006 24-hour NAAQS for PM_{2.5}. 74 Fed. Reg. 58,688, 58,696, 58,702 (Nov. 13,
18 2009).

19 4. Since 2009, EPA has continued to document that the Borough has some of the
20 worst episodic PM_{2.5} pollution in the nation, with ambient air concentrations frequently in excess
21 of the NAAQS for PM_{2.5}—currently by more than almost every other previously designated
22 nonattainment area. See Exhibit 1 at 1 (EPA, *PM_{2.5} Design Values, 2021* at tbl. 1b (“Design

1 Values in Areas Previously Designated Nonattainment for the 2006 24-hour PM_{2.5} NAAQS”)
 2 (May 24, 2022).

3 5. After over seven years of failure to achieve air quality standards in Fairbanks,
 4 EPA finalized a rule reclassifying Fairbanks from a “moderate” to a “serious” nonattainment
 5 area and triggering more stringent requirements. 82 Fed. Reg. 21,711, 21,712 (May 10, 2017).
 6 EPA stated in the rule that it would “prioritize working with Alaska to help the state prepare the
 7 required Serious area attainment plan as expeditiously and efficiently as possible.” *Id.* at 21,714.

8 6. However, EPA has failed to meet its commitment and its statutory obligation to
 9 protect the families of Fairbanks from fine particulate matter pollution. EPA has previously
 10 missed four related deadlines in the Borough’s Clean Air Act process, resulting in four previous
 11 suits before this Court. *See* Compl., *Citizens for Clean Air v. Wheeler*, No. 2:18-cv-01803-TSZ
 12 (W.D. Wash. Dec. 14, 2018), ECF No. 1; Compl., *Citizens for Clean Air v. McCarthy*, No. 2:16-
 13 cv-01594-RAJ (W.D. Wash. Oct. 11, 2016), ECF No. 1; Compl., *Citizens for Clean Air v.*
 14 *McCarthy*, No. 2:16-cv-00857-JCC (W.D. Wash. June 9, 2016), ECF No. 1; Compl., *Citizens for*
 15 *Clean Air v. McCarthy*, No. 2:14-cv-00610-MJP (W.D. Wash. Apr. 24, 2014), ECF No. 1.

16 7. This pattern of delay and inaction has continued since the conclusion of these
 17 lawsuits. Following EPA’s reclassification of the Borough as a “serious” nonattainment area, the
 18 state of Alaska was required to submit a serious area PM_{2.5} SIP no later than December 31, 2017,
 19 40 C.F.R. § 51.1003(b)(2)(ii), but failed to do so until December 13, 2019, just 18 days before
 20 the December 31, 2019, deadline for the Borough to achieve attainment. *See* 85 Fed. Reg. 7760
 21 (Feb. 11, 2020); 82 Fed. Reg. at 21,712. In its proposed SIP, the state requested an extension of
 22 the Borough’s attainment date to December 31, 2024—the maximum allowable time limit. 42
 23 U.S.C. § 7513(e).

1 8. On September 2, 2020, after the Borough’s 2019 attainment date, EPA found that
 2 the air in Fairbanks remained polluted in excess of the 24-hour PM_{2.5} NAAQS. 85 Fed. Reg.
 3 54,509, 54,509-10 (Sept. 2, 2020). EPA also denied the state’s extension request. *Id.* EPA’s
 4 nonattainment finding triggered a requirement for Alaska to submit a revised SIP, including
 5 additional, more stringent provisions, by December 31, 2020. *Id.* The state submitted its revised
 6 SIP proposal to EPA on December 15, 2020.

7 9. Due to EPA’s subsequent inaction, Alaska’s December 15, 2020, revised SIP
 8 proposal remains out of compliance with the Clean Air Act. After the state submitted the revised
 9 SIP proposal, EPA failed to make a completeness determination by the statutory deadline of June
 10 15, 2021. Because of this default, the plan was deemed complete “by operation of law.” 42
 11 U.S.C. § 7410(k)(1)(B). EPA was then required to issue a full approval, full disapproval, or
 12 partial approval and partial disapproval of the entire plan by June 15, 2022. 42 U.S.C.
 13 § 7410(k)(2), (3). To date, EPA has failed to carry out this nondiscretionary duty.

14 10. EPA approved portions of the plan revision on September 24, 2021, 86 Fed. Reg.
 15 52,997 (Sept. 24, 2021), but it failed to approve or disapprove of the remaining portions of the
 16 plan, as the Clean Air Act requires.

17 11. Accordingly, Plaintiffs CITIZENS FOR CLEAN AIR, a project of ALASKA
 18 COMMUNITY ACTION ON TOXICS, and SIERRA CLUB, bring this action to compel
 19 Defendant MICHAEL S. REGAN, in his official capacity as EPA Administrator, and Defendant
 20 CASEY SIXKILLER, in his official capacity as Regional Administrator of EPA Region 10, to
 21 perform their mandatory duties to ensure that the federal government provides the residents of
 22 Fairbanks the protections guaranteed under the Clean Air Act.

JURISDICTION

12. The Court has jurisdiction over this action to compel the performance of EPA's non-discretionary duties under the Clean Air Act's citizen suit provision, 42 U.S.C. § 7604(a)(2), and pursuant to federal question jurisdiction, 28 U.S.C. § 1331. The Court also has authority to order declaratory and injunctive relief pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §§ 2201 and 2202.

NOTICE

13. On July 29, 2022, Plaintiffs provided EPA written notice of the claim stated in this action, as required by 42 U.S.C. § 7604(b)(2). *See Exhibit 2* (J. Lieb, counsel for Plaintiffs, Letter to Michael S. Regan, Adm'r of EPA (July 29, 2022)). A period of sixty days has elapsed since EPA was notified of Plaintiffs' claim. *See* 42 U.S.C. § 7604(b)(2).

VENUE

14. Venue is proper in this Court pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1391(e). Defendant EPA resides in this judicial district. EPA Region 10, which has authority over Alaska, is headquartered in Seattle, Washington. This civil action is brought against officers of the United States acting in their official capacities, and a substantial part of the events or omissions giving rise to the claims in this case occurred in the Western District of Washington. Further, because EPA Region 10 is located within King County, assignment to the Seattle Division is proper under Civil Local Rule 3(d)(1).

PARTIES

15. Plaintiff CITIZENS FOR CLEAN AIR, a project of ALASKA COMMUNITY ACTION ON TOXICS, is a coalition of local community members and citizens' groups in Fairbanks, Alaska, who are committed to cleaning up the air while keeping everyone warm in the winter. The coalition is a project of Alaska Community Action on Toxics, a non-profit

1 environmental health research and advocacy organization whose mission is to assure justice by
2 advocating for environmental and community health.

3 16. Plaintiff SIERRA CLUB is the nation's oldest and largest grassroots
4 environmental organization. The Sierra Club is a national nonprofit organization with 65
5 chapters and over 800,000 members dedicated to exploring, enjoying, and protecting the wild
6 places of the Earth; to practicing and promoting the responsible use of the Earth's ecosystems
7 and resources; to educating and enlisting humanity to protect and restore the quality of the
8 natural and human environment; and to using all lawful means to carry out these objectives. The
9 Alaska Chapter of the Sierra Club has over 1,600 members, including members in the Borough.

10 17. Plaintiffs' members live, raise their families, work, recreate, and conduct
11 educational, advocacy, and other activities in the Borough. They are adversely affected by
12 continuing exposure to levels of PM_{2.5} pollution that exceed the national health-based standards
13 for 24-hour concentrations of PM_{2.5} established under the Clean Air Act. The adverse effects of
14 such pollution include actual or threatened harm to their health; their families' health; their
15 professional, educational, and economic interests; and their aesthetic and recreational enjoyment
16 of the environment in the Borough.

17 18. EPA's failure to timely perform the mandatory duties described in this Complaint
18 has injured and continues to injure the interests of Plaintiffs and their members. The relief
19 requested in this lawsuit would redress these injuries by compelling EPA to take the action
20 mandated by Congress in the Clean Air Act's requirements for addressing and improving air
21 quality in areas violating national air quality standards, such as the Borough.

19. Defendant MICHAEL S. REGAN is sued in his official capacity as the Administrator of EPA. He is responsible for taking various actions to implement and enforce the Clean Air Act, including the mandatory duty at issue in this case.

20. Defendant CASEY SIXKILLER is sued in his official capacity as EPA Regional Administrator for Region 10. He is responsible for implementing and enforcing the Clean Air Act in EPA Region 10, which includes the Borough.

STATUTORY FRAMEWORK

21. Congress enacted the Clean Air Act to “speed up, expand, and intensify the war against air pollution in the United States with a view to assuring that the air we breathe throughout the Nation is wholesome once again.” H.R. Rep. No. 91-1146, at 1 (1970), *reprinted in* 1970 U.S.C.C.A.N. 5356, 5356. Consistent with these goals, the Act requires EPA to set NAAQS for certain pollutants, “the attainment and maintenance of which . . . are requisite to protect the public health” with “an adequate margin of safety,” 42 U.S.C. §§ 7409(a)-(b), and to designate areas with air pollution levels that exceed the national standards as “nonattainment” areas, 42 U.S.C. § 7407(d)(1).

22. The Clean Air Act requires that a nonattainment area that has been designated as “serious” must attain the NAAQS “as expeditiously as practicable but no later than the end of the tenth calendar year after the area’s designation as nonattainment.” 42 U.S.C. § 7513(c)(2).

23. Once a nonattainment area is reclassified as “serious,” a “state[] shall submit to the EPA a Serious area attainment plan . . . within 18 months from the effective date of reclassification, or [two] years before the attainment date, whichever is earlier.” 40 C.F.R. § 51.1003(b)(2)(ii).

1 24. If a state demonstrates to EPA that achieving attainment in a “serious”
 2 nonattainment area by the specified attainment date would be “impracticable,” the EPA may
 3 extend that attainment date only once and by “no more than five years.” 42 U.S.C. § 7513(e).

4 25. No later than six months after a nonattainment area’s attainment date, EPA must
 5 “determine, based on the area’s air quality as of the attainment date, whether the area attained the
 6 standard by that date” and then must “publish a notice in the Federal Register containing such
 7 determination.” 42 U.S.C. § 7509(c)(1)-(2).

8 26. If, based on EPA’s determination, a nonattainment area has failed to reach the
 9 applicable standard for PM_{2.5} by the attainment date, the state containing that nonattainment area
 10 “shall submit a revision to the applicable implementation plan” within 12 months of the
 11 attainment date. 42 U.S.C. §§ 7509(d)(1), 7513a(d); *see also Nat. Res. Def. Council v. EPA*, 706
 12 F.3d 428, 434-37 (D.C. Cir. 2013) (finding that because PM_{2.5} pollution is a subset of PM₁₀
 13 pollution, the Clean Air Act’s regulatory requirements for PM₁₀ apply to PM_{2.5}). Such a plan
 14 revision must demonstrate, through a number of stringent requirements, “that each year the area
 15 will achieve at least a [five] percent reduction in emissions of direct PM_{2.5} or a [five] percent
 16 reduction in emissions of a PM_{2.5} plan precursor based on the most recent emissions inventory
 17 for the area.” 40 C.F.R. § 51.1010(c).

18 27. The Clean Air Act requires EPA to determine whether any state implementation
 19 plan revision is administratively complete. 42 U.S.C. § 7410(k)(1)(B). If, “by the date [six]
 20 months after receipt of the submission,” EPA has not determined that the plan revision fails to
 21 meet the minimum statutory criteria, the plan will be “deemed by operation of law to meet such
 22 minimum criteria.” *Id.*

28. Within 12 months of a determination deemed by operation of law that a plan revision meets the minimum statutory criteria, EPA must approve the entire plan revision “if it meets all of the applicable requirements” for state implementation plans. 42 U.S.C. § 7410(k)(2)-(3). If only a portion of the plan revision meets these applicable requirements, EPA “may approve the plan revision in part and disapprove the plan revision in part.” *Id.* § 7410(k)(3). A partial approval, even if accompanied by a partial disapproval, cannot bring the plan revision into compliance with the Clean Air Act. Instead, “[t]he plan revision shall not be treated as meeting the requirements of this chapter until [EPA] approves the entire plan revision as complying with the applicable requirements of this chapter.” *Id.*

29. If EPA fails to take a non-discretionary action, such as acting on a state implementation plan revision submittal, citizens are empowered to seek a court order to compel prompt action. 42 U.S.C. § 7604(a)(2).

STATEMENT OF FACTS

30. PM_{2.5} refers to fine particles less than or equal to 2.5 micrometers in diameter, including hazardous forms of dirt, soot, smoke, and liquid droplets found in the air. PM_{2.5} is “produced chiefly by combustion processes and by atmospheric reactions of various gaseous pollutants,” and “[s]ources of fine particles include . . . motor vehicles, power generation, combustion sources at industrial facilities, and residential fuel burning.” 71 Fed. Reg. at 61,146.

31. The detrimental effects of PM_{2.5} on human health are significant. Particle pollution is known to “trigger illness, hospitalization and premature death” and “[r]esearchers estimate that PM_{2.5} is responsible for nearly 48,000 premature deaths in the United States every year.” Exhibit 3 at 5, 7 (American Lung Association, *State of the Air 2022* (citing Health Effects Institute. State of Global Air. Boston, MA. 2020)). Even short-term increases in particle

pollution are deadly. Researchers have extensively linked short-term spikes to “increased mortality in infants,” “increased hospital admissions for cardiovascular disease, including heart attacks and strokes,” “increased hospital admissions and emergency department visits for chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD),” and “increased severity of asthma attacks and hospitalization for asthma among children.” *Id.* at 6 (citations omitted). Additional studies have found that PM_{2.5} pollution disproportionately affects communities of color, including Alaska Native communities. *See, e.g.*, Exhibit 4 (C. W. Tessum *et al.*, *PM_{2.5} Polluters Disproportionately and Systemically Affect People of Color in the United States*, 7 SCIENCE ADVANCES 18 (Apr. 28, 2021).)

32. EPA first adopted 24-hour NAAQS for PM_{2.5} in 1997. 62 Fed. Reg. at 38,652. In 2006, EPA strengthened these standards, revising the maximum allowed 24-hour average concentration of PM_{2.5} from 65 micrograms per cubic meter ($\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$) to 35 $\mu\text{g}/\text{m}^3$. 71 Fed. Reg. at 61,144, 61,145-46.

33. Fairbanks has some of the worst PM_{2.5} pollution in the nation, with ambient air concentrations frequently in excess of the 24-hour NAAQS. Of all previously designated nonattainment areas for 24-hour PM_{2.5}, measured by 2019-2021 design values, Fairbanks is the second most polluted, with pollution levels more than twice federal limits. *See Exhibit 1.* In 2021, the American Lung Association found that Fairbanks had the highest levels of short-term particle pollution in any U.S. city, and in 2022, Fairbanks ranked third by that same metric. *See Exhibit 5 at 3-4* (American Lung Association, *State of the Air 2021* (listing the most polluted cities by short-term particulate matter for 2021)); Exhibit 3 at 12-13 (listing the most polluted cities by short-term particulate matter for 2022).

1 34. On November 13, 2009, EPA designated the Borough as a nonattainment area
 2 with respect to 24-hour PM_{2.5} NAAQS. 74 Fed. Reg. at 58,696, 58,702.

3 35. At that time, the Borough was classified as a “moderate” nonattainment area with
 4 an attainment date of December 31, 2015. 79 Fed. Reg. 31,566, 31,568, 31570 (June 2, 2014);
 5 *see also* 42 U.S.C. § 7513(c)(1) (“For a Moderate Area, the attainment date shall be as
 6 expeditiously as practicable but no later than the end of the sixth calendar year after the area’s
 7 designation as nonattainment.”).

8 36. After the Borough failed to achieve attainment by December 31, 2015, and in
 9 response to a lawsuit filed by Plaintiffs in this Court, EPA determined that Fairbanks had not yet
 10 reached attainment and reclassified the Borough to a “serious” nonattainment area on May 10,
 11 2017. 82 Fed. Reg. at 21,712; *Citizens for Clean Air v. Pruitt*, No. 2:16-cv-01594-RAJ (W.D.
 12 Wash. Sept. 7, 2017), ECF No. 14.

13 37. As a “serious” nonattainment area, the Borough’s attainment date for the 24-hour
 14 PM_{2.5} NAAQS was “no later than the end of the tenth calendar year beginning after the area’s
 15 [initial] designation as nonattainment,” 42 U.S.C. § 7513(c)(2), that is, no later than December
 16 31, 2019. 82 Fed. Reg. at 21,712.

17 38. The state of Alaska was required to submit a proposed serious area PM_{2.5} SIP
 18 addressing the more stringent requirements of that designation “within 18 months from the
 19 effective date of reclassification, or 2 years before the attainment date, whichever is earlier,” 40
 20 C.F.R. § 51.1003(b)(2)(ii). In this case the earlier date was two years before attainment, so the
 21 State’s plan was due no later than December 31, 2017. 82 Fed. Reg. at 21,712.

22 39. The state of Alaska failed to submit a serious area PM_{2.5} SIP for nearly two years
 23 after the initial deadline. Following a lawsuit initiated by Plaintiffs in this Court, Alaska

1 submitted its serious area SIP on December 13, 2019. 85 Fed. Reg. at 7760; Comp., *Citizens for*
 2 *Clean Air v. Wheeler*, No. 2:18-cv-01803-TSZ (W.D. Wash. Dec. 14, 2018), ECF No. 1.

3 40. In its submittal Alaska requested that EPA grant the maximum allowable
 4 extension of the Borough’s attainment date, from December 31, 2019, to December 31, 2024.
 5 *See* 42 U.S.C. § 7513(e) (allowing EPA to extend the attainment date for a serious area SIP “at
 6 most one” time and by “no more than five years”).

7 41. However, Alaska stated in its submittal that its plan to meet the 2024 attainment
 8 date was “unrealistic and not practicable,” and that it believed December 31, 2029, was in fact
 9 “the most expeditious attainment date practicable.” Alaska Dep’t of Env’t Conservation,
 10 Amend. to State Air Quality Control Plan Vol II: III.D.7.9 at III.D.7.9-5 (Nov. 19, 2019).

11 42. On September 2, 2020, EPA found that Alaska had failed to achieve attainment in
 12 Fairbanks by the 2019 deadline. 85 Fed. Reg. at 54,509-10. It also denied the state’s extension
 13 request based on its finding that Alaska had in fact requested a ten-year extension and had
 14 otherwise failed to include appropriate attainment measures in its plan. *Id.*; 85 Fed. Reg. 29,879,
 15 29,880-81 (May 19, 2020).)

16 43. EPA’s finding triggered a statutory mandate for Alaska to submit a plan revision,
 17 subject to even more stringent requirements set out in 40 C.F.R. § 51.1010(c), by December 31,
 18 2020. 42 U.S.C. §§ 7509(d), 7513a(d); 85 Fed. Reg. at 54,509.

19 44. Alaska submitted its plan revision on December 15, 2020.

20 45. Because EPA failed to determine whether Alaska’s plan revision was
 21 administratively complete “by the date [six] months after receipt of the submission,” the plan
 22 revision was “deemed by operation of law to meet [the] minimum criteria” for completeness on
 23 June 15, 2021. 42 U.S.C. § 7410(k)(1)(B).

46. On September 24, 2021, EPA approved portions of the plan revision. 86 Fed. Reg. at 52,997. This partial approval was not accompanied by a partial disapproval. *Id.*

47. By June 15, 2022, or “within 12 months” of the determination by operation of law that the plan was administratively complete, EPA was required to act on the entire plan revision by issuing a full approval, a full disapproval, or a partial approval and partial disapproval. 42 U.S.C. §§ 7410(k)(2)-(3).

48. EPA failed to approve or disapprove, or approve in part and disapprove in part, the entire plan revision by June 15, 2022, and it still has not made this determination as of the filing of this complaint.

CLAIM FOR RELIEF

(Clean Air Act: Failure to issue approval or disapproval of plan revision as a whole)

49. The state of Alaska submitted a revision of the serious area PM_{2.5} SIP for the Fairbanks North Star Borough on December 15, 2020.

50. On June 15, 2021, the state of Alaska's plan revision for the Borough was deemed by operation of law to meet the minimum criteria for administrative completeness.

51. Pursuant to 42 U.S.C. §§ 7410(k)(2)-(3), EPA had a mandatory duty to approve or disapprove, or approve in part and disapprove in part, the entire plan revision within twelve months of the determination by operation of law that the plan revision was administratively complete (by no later than June 15, 2022).

52. EPA has failed to perform this mandatory duty.

53. Accordingly, EPA has been in continuous violation of the Clean Air Act, 42 U.S.C. §§ 7410(k)(2)-(3), since June 15, 2022.

54. EPA's Clean Air Act violation constitutes a "failure of the Administrator to perform [an] act or duty under [chapter 85] which is not discretionary with the Administrator."

1 within the meaning of the Clean Air Act's citizen suit provision. 42 U.S.C. § 7604(a)(2). The
2 violation is ongoing.

3 **PRAYER FOR RELIEF**

4 Wherefore, Plaintiffs respectfully request that the Court:

5 55. Declare that the Administrator is in violation of the Clean Air Act with regard to
6 his mandatory, nondiscretionary duty under 42 U.S.C. §§ 7410(k)(2)-(3) to approve or
7 disapprove or approve in part and disapprove in part the state of Alaska's entire plan revision for
8 the serious area nonattainment SIP addressing 24-hour concentrations of PM_{2.5} in the Fairbanks
9 North Star Borough;

10 56. Issue an injunction requiring the Administrator to make and publish in the Federal
11 Register a determination of approval, disapproval, or partial approval and partial disapproval, as
12 required by law;

13 57. Retain jurisdiction of this matter until such time as EPA has complied with its
14 non-discretionary duties under the Clean Air Act;

15 58. Award to Plaintiffs their reasonable costs of litigation, including attorney's fees
16 and expert witness fees; and

17 59. Grant such further relief as the Court deems just and proper.

18 Respectfully submitted this 28th day of September, 2022.

19 *s/ Marisa C. Ordonia*

20 Marisa C. Ordonia (WSB #48081)
EARTHJUSTICE
21 810 3rd Avenue, Suite 610
Seattle, WA 98104-1711
T: 206.343.7340
F: 206.343.1526
E: mordonia@earthjustice.org

1 Hannah M. Payne (AK Bar #2105045) (*pro hac vice* pending)
2 Jeremy C. Lieb (AK Bar #1810088) (*pro hac vice* pending)
3 EARTHJUSTICE
4 441 W 5th Avenue, Suite 301
5 Anchorage, AK 99501
T: 907.277.2500
F: 907.277.1390
E: hpayne@earthjustice.org
jlieb@earthjustice.org

6 *Attorneys for Citizens for Clean Air, a project of Alaska*
7 *Community Action on Toxics, and Sierra Club*